



















**Cell: IA19****Comment:** Rick Heede:

CDIAC data in million tonnes of carbon converted to CO<sub>2</sub>, which is 3.664191 times Carbon if carbon and oxygen isotopes are accounted for, per Kevin Baumert May05, then at World resources Institute: CO<sub>2</sub> conversion is, precisely: C=12.0107 + O=15.9994 x 2 = 44.0095/12.0107 = 3.664191.

**Cell: IA21****Comment:** Rick Heede:

From the associated "Methods" paper: CDIAC's emissions are estimated for each fuel using the following formula: CO<sub>2</sub> = (P) (FO) (C).

From crude oil and natural gas liquids production in the global-total accounts2

CO<sub>2l</sub> = CO<sub>2</sub> emissions in 106 metric tons of carbon

P<sub>l</sub> = annual production or consumption in 106 tons

FO<sub>l</sub> = 0.918 ± 3%

C<sub>l</sub> = carbon content in tons C per ton fuel = 0.85 ± 1%

From primary and secondary liquid fuel production and trade in the national accounts when non-energy liquid products are specifically subtracted3

CO<sub>2l</sub> = CO<sub>2</sub> emissions in 106 metric tons of carbon

P<sub>l</sub> = annual production or consumption in 106 tons

FO<sub>l</sub> = 0.985 ± 3%

C<sub>l</sub> = carbon content in tons C per ton fuel = 0.85 + 1% ± 2%.

Boden, T.A., G. Marland, and R.J. Andres. 2009. Global, Regional, and National Fossil-Fuel CO<sub>2</sub> Emissions. Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Center, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, U.S. Department of Energy, Oak Ridge, Tenn., U.S.A. doi 10.3334/CDIAC/00001. Jan10: CMS added CDIAC extrapolations for gas emissions from their dataset "Preliminary 2007-08 Global & National Estimates by Extrapolation" (undated) to the main file cited above.

**Cell: IA33****Comment:** Rick Heede:

CDIAC data in million tonnes of carbon converted to CO<sub>2</sub>, which is 3.664191 times Carbon if carbon and oxygen isotopes are accounted for, per Kevin Baumert May05, then at World resources Institute: CO<sub>2</sub> conversion is, precisely: C=12.0107 + O=15.9994 x 2 = 44.0095/12.0107 = 3.664191.

**Cell: IA35****Comment:** Rick Heede:

From the associated "Methods" paper: CDIAC's emissions are estimated for each fuel using the following formula: CO<sub>2</sub> = (P) (FO) (C).

From primary and secondary gas fuel production and trade:

CO<sub>2</sub> = CO<sub>2</sub> emissions in 10^6 metric tonnes of carbon;

P = annual production or consumption in thousands of 10^12 joules;

FO = 0.98 ± 1%;

C = carbon content in 10^6 tonnes per thousand 10^12 joules = 0.0137 ± 2%.

Boden, T.A., G. Marland, and R.J. Andres. 2009. Global, Regional, and National Fossil-Fuel CO<sub>2</sub> Emissions. Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Center, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, U.S. Department of Energy, Oak Ridge, Tenn., U.S.A. doi 10.3334/CDIAC/00001.

**Cell: IA47****Comment:** Rick Heede:

CDIAC data in million tonnes of carbon converted to CO<sub>2</sub>, which is 3.664191 times Carbon if carbon and oxygen isotopes are accounted for, per Kevin Baumert May05, then at World resources Institute: CO<sub>2</sub> conversion is, precisely: C=12.0107 + O=15.9994 x 2 = 44.0095/12.0107 = 3.664191.

**Cell: IA49****Comment:** Rick Heede:

From the associated "Methods" paper: CDIAC's emissions are estimated for each fuel using the following formula: CO<sub>2</sub> = (P) (FO) (C).

From primary and secondary solid fuel production and trade5

CO<sub>2s</sub> = CO<sub>2</sub> emissions in 106 metric tons of carbon

P<sub>s</sub> = annual production or consumption in 106 tons coal equivalent

FO<sub>s</sub> = 0.982 ± 2%

C<sub>s</sub> = carbon content in tons C per ton coal equivalent = 0.746 ± 2%.

While there is, as Marland et al point out, a strong correlation between heat rate and carbon content and the "C content is quite constant when production is in units of tonnes coal equivalent where 1 tonne coal equivalent is defined as 29.31 10^9 joules." CMS factor of 21 million Btu per short on = 23.15 million Btu/tonne, and the CDIAC datum (29.31 10^9 joules/tonne) = 27.78 million Btu/tonne.

CDIAC uses average carbon content of 74.6 percent per tonne of coal equivalent, whereas CMS uses an average factor of 60.1 percent for utility coal per tonne (albeit not the same equiv tonne used by CDIAC; the average utility coal factor CMS applies to coal production when coal rank is not specified ).

If we modify "average utility coal" to CDIAC's coal equivalent, the CMS carbon factor per tonne of coal becomes 27.78/23.15 = 1.20; 1.20 times the CMS carbon content per tonne of average utility coal = 601.4 tonne carbon per tonne of coal times 1.2 = 721.7 kgC/tonne, or 0.7217. Compare CDIAC's carbon factor of 0.746 ± 2%, which is 3.4 percent higher than the adjusted CMS factor. In practice, however, for the companies and countries listed in the coal production sheet, and applying the coal ranks when known (and thus a higher proportion of lignite than higher-grade coals on a tonnage basis), the AVERAGE coal contains 0.5733 tonne carbon per tonne produced (20July06: 72,724 million tonnes C / 126,862 million tonnes coal produced = 0.5733). (Note: this is prior to any application of oxidation rate and non-fuel uses.) In sum, CMS may be underestimating the emissions of carbon dioxide by (0.746 - 0.573) = 0.302, or 30.2 percent relative to the CDIAC data.

Now, let's compare the annual CDIAC carbon data with EIA's global coal production data as follows:

1990: CDIAC estimates 2,378 million tonnes carbon (MTC) vs EIA coal production of 4,851 million tonnes of coal: 0.4902 tC/tonne coal;

2000: CDIAC estimates 2,214 million tonnes carbon (MTC) vs EIA coal production of 4,473 million tonnes of coal: 0.4950 tC/tonne coal.

In other words, curious results compared to the CDIAC factors discussed above, even though the FO (fuel oxidation rate) factor is not applied to 1990 and 2000; the FO would reduce the carbon emitted from a tonne of coal by 1.8 percent.

Applying CDIAC's formula of CO<sub>2</sub> = (P) (FO) (C) without making any adjustment for CDIAC's coal equivalent or fuel oxidation rate for 2000 coal production: CO<sub>2</sub> = (4,473 million tonnes of coal produced) \* 0.982 \* 0.746 = 3,277 million tonnes of carbon; in contrast, CDIAC's estimated emissions = 2,214 MTC. The EIA data includes lignite, sub-bituminous, bituminous, and anthracite coal.

CMS has not resolved this apparent discrepancy between CDIAC emissions estimates from combustion of solid fuels and the EIA coal production data.

Sources: Marland, Gregg, Tom Boden, & R. J. Andres (~2005) "Global, Regional, and National Fossil Fuel CO<sub>2</sub> Emissions," Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Center (CDIAC), Oak Ridge National Laboratory, US DOE, [http://cdiac.esd.ornl.gov/trends/emis/em\\_cont.htm](http://cdiac.esd.ornl.gov/trends/emis/em_cont.htm)

Boden, T.A., G. Marland, and R.J. Andres. 2009. Global, Regional, and National Fossil-Fuel CO<sub>2</sub> Emissions. Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Center, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, U.S. Department of Energy, Oak Ridge, Tenn., U.S.A. doi 10.3334/CDIAC/00001.

**Cell: IA51****Comment:** Rick Heede:

Of CDIAC estimated emissions of carbon dioxide from combustion of coal worldwide 1751-2004, CMS has identified (at this writing, 26Nov06) 47.5 percent from the production of coal by identified producers from 1990 to 2004. Note that CMS has differentiated emissions by rank of coal produced, when company or country production data makes this possible to do.

**Cell: HI69****Comment:** Rick Heede:

CMS reviews numerous estimates of flaring emissions in the oil and gas industries in the worksheets in "AncillaryCH4&CO2.xls".

See "Flaring and Venting" worksheet in the "AncillaryCH4&CO2.xls" workbook for details.

**Cell: HP69****Comment:** Rick Heede:

Flaring rates are calculated in the worksheet "AncillaryCH4&CO2.xls".

See the "Flaring and Venting" worksheet in the AncillaryCO2CH4.xls workbook.

**Cell: IA75****Comment:** Rick Heede:

CDIAC data in million tonnes of carbon converted to CO<sub>2</sub>, which is 3.664191 times Carbon if carbon and oxygen isotopes are accounted for, per Kevin Baumert May05, then at World Resources Institute: CO<sub>2</sub> conversion is, precisely: C=12.0107 + O=15.9994 x 2 = 44.0095/12.0107 = 3.664191.

**Cell: IA77****Comment:** Rick Heede:

Marland, Gregg, & Ralph Rotty (1984) "Carbon dioxide emissions from fossil fuels: a procedure for estimation and results for 1950-1982," Tellus, vol. 36b:232-261.

Fossil fuel, cement, and flaring emissions are estimated in the dataset available at: [http://cdiac.ornl.gov/by\\_new/bysubject.html#trace](http://cdiac.ornl.gov/by_new/bysubject.html#trace)

Boden, T.A., G. Marland, and R.J. Andres. 2011. Global, Regional, and National Fossil-Fuel CO<sub>2</sub> Emissions. Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Center, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, U.S. Department of Energy, Oak Ridge, Tenn., U.S.A. doi 10.3334/CDIAC/00001.

**Cell: HY91****Comment:** Rick Heede:

Curiously, the CDIAC data through 2013, if all sources are added, as we have done here, total precisely 6 Mt larger than CDIAC's own sum of sources.